Kyrgyz Republic

Community Development and Investment Agency (ARIS)

National Community Initiatives Project
P180909

Stakeholders Engagement Plan (SEP)

February 2024

Contents

Abbreviations and acronyms 3

1. Introduction/Project Description 4

2. Objective/Description of SEP 5

3. Stakeholder identification and analysis 5

3.1. Methodology 5

3.2. Affected parties and other interested parties 6

3.3. Disadvantaged/vulnerable individuals or groups 7

4. Stakeholder Engagement Program 8

4.1. Summary of stakeholder engagement done during project preparation 8

4.2. Summary of project stakeholder needs and methods, tools, and techniques for stakeholder engagement 10

4.3. Stakeholder engagement plan 10

4.4. Reporting back to stakeholders 12

5. Resources and Responsibilities for implementing stakeholder engagement activities 12

5.1. Resources 12

6. Grievance Mechanism 13

6.1. Description of GM 13

6.2. GM channels 16

6.3. Handling of sensitive grievances 17

6.4. World Bank Grievance Redress Service 17

7. Monitoring and Reporting 17

7.1. Review of Field Engagement Activities 18

7.2. Reporting on stakeholder engagement activities 18

7.3. Project's annual reports 19

7.4. Project's semi-annual reports on compliance with environmental and social standards 19

Annex 1. Minutes of the public consultations 20

Annex 2. Template of complaint form 26

Table 1. Stakeholder mapping 7

Table 2. Stakeholder consultations 9

Table 3. Stakeholder engagement plan 10

Table 4. Tentative budget (5 years) 12

Table 5. Addressing complaints 13

Abbreviations and acronyms

AA	Aiyl Aimak - rural subdistrict
AO	Aiyl okmotu - local self-government body
ARIS	Community Development and Investment Agency
BFM	Beneficiaries' Feedback Mechanism
CCCA	Community Climate Change Ambassador
CDSO	Community Development Support Officer
ED	Executive Director
ESF	Environmental and Social Framework
ESMP	Environmental and Social Management Plan
ESS	Environmental and Social Standards
FM	Financial Management
GBV	Gender-Based Violence
GM	Grievance Mechanism
KR	Kyrgyz Republic
LMP	Labor Management Procedures
LSG	Local Self-Government Bodies
MES	Ministry of Emergency Situations
MIS	Management Information System
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MWRAPI	Ministry of Water resources, Agriculture and Processing Industry
NCIP	National Community Initiatives Project
NGO	Non-Governmental Organizations
PDO	Project Development Objective
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
POM	Project Operations Manual
SEA	Sexual Exploitation and Abuse
SEDP	Socio-Economic Development Program
SEP	Stakeholder Engagement Plan
SH	Sexual Harassment
VIP-3 AF	Third Village Investment Project Additional Financing

1. Introduction/Project Description

The development objective of the National Community Initiative Project (P180909) is to improve access to climate-resilient local social infrastructure and increase economic livelihood opportunities for women and youth in beneficiary communities.

The National Community Initiatives Project (NCIP) builds on a series of CDD operations (Village Investment and CASA-1000 Community Support projects). It will be implemented in the KR's 40 rayons (districts) across seven oblasts (regions)— Naryn, Issyk-Kul, Chui, Talas, Batken, Osh and Jalal-Abad. It will scale up, standardize, and deepen impact of CDD operations by: (i) providing a national platform covering all 40 districts (to date, different projects separately covered northern and southern regions); (ii) increasing average infrastructure sub-grants to target sub-districts; (iii) focusing livelihoods support on women and youth, and better linking livelihood activities with opportunities created by investments (e.g., helping women with children who can now attend kindergarten use time to pursue income-generating opportunities); (iv) streamlining project processes and institutional arrangements; and (v) embedding participatory approaches into the Local Self-Government Bodies (LSGs). While it will provide a national platform across all 40 districts, the first phase will cover only one Aiyl Aimak (AA - sub-district) per district (i.e., 40 out of 452 AA). The target AAs will be selected based on criteria such as poverty, remoteness, economic potential, etc. Each targeted AA will receive social mobilization, capacity building, and social infrastructure investments, plus a subset of the targeted AAs will also receive livelihoods activities targeting women and youth. Given limited funds and in order to strengthen incentives, Component 2 livelihood support will be provided to AAs based on their performance on Component 1 activities. The project will include the following components:

Component 1: Village infrastructure Investments and institution strengthening. This component will provide subgrants to 40 AAs to finance local-level, climate-resilient, socio-economic infrastructure that addresses priorities identified through a participatory village needs assessment and decision-making process as defined in the forthcoming project operations manual (POM). It will provide associated social mobilization and capacity building activities to institutionalize CDD mechanisms to the local development processes. This component will strengthen the capacity of local self-government bodies (Aiyl Okmotu and Aiyl Kenesh) and community members and local level institutions, to engage with villagers and deliver services efficiently, fairly, and in a way that responds to the needs of citizens, including youth and women.

Subcomponent 1a: Socio-economic infrastructure investments. This subcomponent will contribute to the infrastructure aspects of the PDO. It will provide subgrants for social infrastructure investments to 40 selected AAs (sub-districts), one per district across the country. Through investments in infrastructure, communities will have access to improved social and economic infrastructure for poverty reduction, enhanced livelihoods, women and youth development.

Subcomponent 1b: Mobilization and institution strengthening of communities and local self-governments. Based on lessons from World Bank programming that CDD promotes social cohesion and inclusion, including for women and youth led activities[1], subcomponent 1b will support a range of community mobilization and capacity building activities to ensure that: (i) communities, particularly women, youth, and vulnerable, are actively engaged in selecting poverty-focused project interventions; (ii) subcomponent 1a investments are highly prioritized by communities; (iii) all members of the target communities are provided with information, facilitation and capacity building necessary to make decisions that are needs-based and inclusive of women, vulnerable, and poor households; and (iv) local self-governments, and associated working groups, gain capacity to utilize participatory, transparent approaches to identify, implement and monitor local development projects. The support will be detailed in a Project Operations Manual (POM):

[1] This process will be based on the experience and lessons learned from the implementation of CASA1000 CSP and VIP-3 projects, aiming to promote social cohesion and inclusion through Community-Driven Development (CDD).

Component 2: Local economic development and livelihood opportunities for women and youth. This component will support local economic development to improve the economic well-being and the quality of life for the targeted community with special focus on women and youth. All 40 AAs will be supported with market assessments, technical support and business skills. 15 AAs out of the original 40 will be selected to receive livelihood grants, based on the quality of their Cycle 2 social mobilization process and quality of business plans for livelihoods investments.

Component 3: Project Management. This component will finance project management and implementation of project-associated activities. It will cover the operating costs of the Community Development and Investment Agency (ARIS). It will support independent audits, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) (including collecting gender-disaggregated data), and quality assurance to ensure compliance with best procurement and financial management (FM) practices. This component will also support Environmental and Social (E&S) Framework compliance, including stakeholder consultation, a robust grievance mechanism (GM), online platform, communication and development of site-specific assessments and plans.
This component will finance the incremental operating costs and other eligible expenses associated with project implementation, which include the coordination and supervision of implementation activities, midline and endline evaluations, annual audits, and monitoring and evaluation. ARIS will also be responsible for preparing annual work plans and budgets for Ministry of Finance (MoF) approval, respectively, hiring of external auditors, and ensuring that the project maintains strong focus on gender inclusion and citizen engagement in project activities.

Component 4: Contingent Emergency Response Component (CERC). CERC is a zero-dollar component which could be used in the event of an urgent need for assistance in response to an eligible crisis or emergency, will enable the Government of Kyrgyz Republic to reallocate project funds to response efforts. The CERC would be implemented in accordance with the Bank's Policy on Investment Project Financing, Projects in Situations of Urgent Need of Assistance or Capacity Constraints. A specific annex to the POM will apply to this component, detailing the FM, procurement, environmental and social standards, eligible expenditures, and any other necessary implementation arrangements.
The NCIP is being prepared under the World Bank's Environment and Social Framework (ESF). As per the Environmental and Social Standard ESS10 on Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure, ARIS as an implementing agency should provide stakeholders with timely, relevant, understandable, and accessible information, and consult with them in a culturally appropriate manner, which is free of manipulation, interference, coercion, discrimination, or intimidation.

2. Objective/Description of SEP

The overall objective of this SEP is to define a program for stakeholder engagement, ensure the inclusion of voices during the project preparation and social economic activities, including timely public information disclosure and consultation throughout the entire project cycle. The SEP outlines the ways in which the project team will communicate with stakeholders and includes a mechanism by which people can raise concerns, provide feedback, or make complaints about project activities or any activities related to the project.
Since the exact location for project implementation is not yet determined, this Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) outlines general principles and a fundamental collaborative strategy for identifying stakeholders and planning the stakeholder process for the NCIP.

3. Stakeholder identification and analysis

3.1. Methodology

In order to meet best practice approaches, the project will apply the following principles for stakeholder engagement:

- *Openness and life-cycle approach:* Public consultations for the NCIP will be arranged during the whole

life cycle, carried out in an open manner, free of external manipulation, interference, coercion, or intimidation.

- *Informed participation and feedback:* Information will be provided to and widely distributed among all stakeholders in an appropriate format; opportunities are provided for communicating stakeholder feedback, and for analyzing and addressing comments and concerns.
- *Inclusiveness and sensitivity:* Stakeholder identification is undertaken to support better communications and build effective relationships. The participation process for the projects is inclusive. All stakeholders at all times are encouraged to be involved in the consultation process. Equal access to information is provided to all stakeholders. Sensitivity to stakeholders' needs is the key principle underlying the selection of engagement methods. Special attention is given to vulnerable groups that may be at risk of being left out of project benefits, particularly women, the elderly, persons with disabilities, displaced persons, and migrant workers and communities, and the cultural sensitivities of diverse ethnic groups.
- *Flexibility:* The methodology should adapt to other forms of engagement depending on cultural context and project area, including various forms of internet- or phone-based communication and focus group discussions.

3.2. Affected parties and other interested parties[2]

In accordance with the Environmental and Socio Standard ESS10, the Project has identified the following categories of a project individual or groups:
"Project Affected Parties" individuals or groups that are or may be directly affected by the project;
"Other stakeholders are" individuals or groups who may have an interest in the project.

Project Affected parties include local communities, community members, and other parties that may be subject to direct impacts from the NCIP. Specifically, the following individuals and groups fall within this category:

- Communities in 40 AA
- Representatives of AO and working groups
- Representatives of Ayil Keneshs
- Community leaders
- Vulnerable individuals or groups
- Climate Change Ambassadors
- Community Reporters
- State and local authorities interested and involved in project planning and implementation, coordination of project activities.

Other stakeholders include:

- Representatives of regional and district state bodies;
- Representatives of regional and district state administrations, representatives of regional structural subdivisions;
- Elected / appointed civil servants in aiyl okmotu and aiyl keneshs;
- Non-elected leaders who are widely recognized in their community, such as chairpersons of local initiative groups or water users' associations, teachers, representatives of schools, kindergartens or community organizations, including community youth organizations;
- Leaders of community organizations, civil society organizations, media, local NGOs and women's groups, youth committees and heads of women's councils, village neighborhood committees and businesses;
- Public service providers (institutions and enterprises);
- Business partners;
- Representatives of contractor organizations.

[2] "Stakeholder" refers to individuals or groups who: (a) are affected or likely to be affected by the project (project-affected parties); and (b) may have an interest in the project (other interested parties).

3.3. Disadvantaged/vulnerable individuals or groups[3]

Within NCIP, vulnerable or disadvantaged groups may include but are not limited to the following:

- Working poor women and men - this includes a group of men 16-63 years old and women 16-58 years old who are registered in aiyl okmoty and have a social passport of a poor family;
- Unemployed women of working age - women between 16 and 58 years of age who receive unemployment benefits and do not have a temporary job;
- Poor families with 6 or more children - families with 6 or more children who are registered in aiyl okmoty and have a social passport of a low-income family;
- Poor female-headed households - female-headed households registered with aiyl okmotu and having a social passport of a low-income family.
- People with disabilities.

Vulnerable groups within the communities affected by the Project may be added, further confirmed, and consulted through various means, as gatherings and focus-groups. The Table 1 below defines relevant areas of interests for the stakeholder groups. Description of the methods of engagement that willbe undertaken by the project is provided in the following sections.

Table 1. Stakeholder mapping

Stakeholder groups	Area of interest in the project	Interest Level	Influence
Parties directly impacted by the Project			
Community members in 40 AA in Naryn, Issyk-Kul, Chui, Talas, Batken, Osh and Jalal-Abad Oblasts	Interest in the projects directly impacts livelihoods, involving an understanding of project benefits and, if necessary, compensation procedures	High	High
Vulnerable groups in all target Oblasts: • Working poor women and men - this includes a group of men 16-63 years old and women 16-58 years old who are registered in aiyl okmoty and have a social passport of a poor family; • Unemployed women of working age - women between 16 and 58 years of age who receive unemployment benefits and do not have a temporary job; • Poor families with 6 or more children - families with 6 or more children who are registered in aiyl okmoty and have a social passport of a low-income family;	Migrants who have returned from abroad due to the spread of the coronavirus pandemic and who want to stay and work in the country.	High	Medium

[3] "Disadvantaged or vulnerable persons" means those who are more likely to be affected by project impacts and/or face greater constraints than others on their ability to benefit from the project. It is also more likely that such an individual or group will be excluded from or unable to fully participate in the main consultation process and may therefore require special measures and/or assistance.

• Poor female-headed households - female-headed households registered with aiyl okmotu and having a social passport of a low-income family; • People with disabilities.			
State and local authorities involved in preparation and implementation of the Project			
• Ministry of Finance; • Ministry of Economy and Commerce; • Ministry of Natural Resources, Ecology and Technical Supervision • Department of Disease Prevention and State Sanitary and Epidemiological Surveillance • Administrations of Naryn, Issyk-Kul, Chui, Talas, Batken, Osh and Jalal-Abad Oblasts; • Heads of AAs; • Local councils; • Ministry of Health • State Agency for Civil Service and Local Self-Governance; • State Agency for Architecture, Construction and Housing and Communal Services.	Interest in project planning and implementation, coordination of project activities and distribution of services, addressing potential environmental, social, health and safety impacts.	High	Medium
Other stakeholders			
• Ministry of Water resources, Agriculture and Processing Industry (MWRAPI); • Ministry of Labor, Social Security and Migration; • Forest Service under the Ministry of Emergency Situations; • Water Resources Service under the Ministry of Agriculture; • Veterinary Service under the MWRAPI; • Land and Water Supervision Service under the MWRAPI; • Department of Pastures and Livestock Breeding under the MWRAPI.	Potential interest in project planning and implementation, coordination of project activities and distribution of services, addressing potential environmental, social, health and safety impacts.	Medium	Medium
NGO, Local civil society organizations	Support for vulnerable groups	Medium	Medium

4. Stakeholder Engagement Program

4.1. Summary of stakeholder engagement done during project preparation

During NCIP preparation the meetings have been held with the World Bank and representatives of the state bodies. The SEP represents the starting point for an iterative process of developing a more comprehensive strategy and stakeholder engagement plan. It will be updated periodically as needed, with more detailed

information provided in the first update scheduled after the NPIS is approved. Stakeholders will receive information as the NPIS develops, including reporting on the project's environmental and social performance, as well as on the implementation of the Stakeholder Engagement Plan and grievance mechanism. This SEP will be updated and re-disclosed as necessary.

Table 2. Stakeholder consultations

Location	Date	Method of engagement and Participants	Key questions for discussion
Bishkek	18 October 2022	Meetings with the World Bank (WB) Representatives, the Coordinator and responsible specialists of the VIP-3 AF, responsible representatives of government agencies (Ministry of Finance of the Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Economy and Commerce of the Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Labor, Social Security and Migration of the Kyrgyz Republic, State Agency of State Services and Local Self-Government under the Cabinet of Ministers of the Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Digital Development of the Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Natural Resources, Environment and Technical Supervision of the Kyrgyz Republic).	Discuss planning activities and explore interest in livelihood activities, including interest of business players in participating in the value chain under the project, co-management at the local level, SEDP development and implementation, social accountability, capacity building, preschool education (supporting activities to improve preschool education, climate change adaptation and mitigation activities, income-generating activities for women with financing and earning opportunities
Bishkek	March-May 2023	Meetings of ARIS management with relevant committees of the Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic	Providing information on the design of NCIP, providing explanations to representatives of parliamentary committees of the Kyrgyz Republic.
Bishkek	December 2023 - January 2024	Meetings with CDSO (field staff) and social mobilization specialists, using online platform (and other communication tools Zoom, MS team, Google meet etc.)	Discussion of the social mobilization activities and implementation arrangements of the project.
Kyrgyz Republic	19-29 January 2024	Public consultations with the representatives of district government bodies, aiyl aimaks and keneshes, local residents of all 40 districts of the Kyrgyz Republic. (The details are given under the table below)	Project summary, components Selection criteria Institutional arrangements Environmental and social requirements of the project, Stakeholder engagement Grievance Mechanism

The drafts of ESF instruments prepared by ARIS, including the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF), Stakeholders Engagement Plan (SEP), Labor Management Procedures (LMP) and Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP), Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) have been disclosed for the public consultations from January 19, 2024 to January 29, 2024 at ARIS website. The communities were provided with the link to documents (https://www.aris.kg/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1520&Itemid=444&lang=ru), as well as with the link to ARIS online platform (https://kyrgyz-demo-republic-village-covid-19.yrpri.org/group/30464). The ARIS online information platform was used to distribute the project's information and to receive feedback from beneficiaries and other stakeholders of the project. On January 29, 2024, an online conference was conducted via Zoom to discuss the developed documents. The session covered project information and details on the Environmental and Social Framework Documents. Participants were provided with the chance to ask questions during the meeting. Public consultations have been completed on January 29, 2024. 6012 beneficiaries familiarized with the document on the online platform; women's participation amounted to 3587 (60%) (6374

views on ARIS website). The online conference was attended by 846 people (293 women - 35%). More detailed information about the public consultations is in Annex 1.

4.2. Summary of project stakeholder needs and methods, tools, and techniques for stakeholder engagement

Overall, the project is built around broader and more systematic interaction between ARIS, local government, and it stakeholders and citizens. The project is providing capacity building to Aiyl Okmotu and Aiyl Kenesh on the mandated participatory processes related to needs assessment, preparation of local development plans, and engagement of community members on annual performance via public hearings. In addition, the project investments call for increased participation of women and men through elected committees in planning and implementing subprojects and monitoring the service delivery. It is anticipated that the impact of enhanced participation will help to: (i) build the confidence and strengthen the capacity of local communities to engage in decision-making on a broad range of services, which directly affect people's lives; (ii) make government especially at the local level be more responsive and accountable to its citizens; (iii) enhance the quality of services and the efficiency of their delivery (by using robust ICT supported feedback system and GM); and (iv) ensure that the views and voices of the most vulnerable groups, especially and female headed households, are reflected in the selection and implementation of subprojects under Component 1 and 2.

Different engagement methods are proposed to cover different needs as given in the Stakeholder Engagement Plan given below:

- Information meetings, press tours, public hearings, public meetings/gatherings at the village/aimak level, public organizations, media;
- Use of digital tools, including online platforms, social networks, online groups, online meetings of the parties;
- Robust interactive online "platform" which not only provides up to date information but also allows for consultations, feedback and decision making for the stakeholders;
- Participation in working groups to discuss normative legal act, organize and conduct certain local activities, public discussions on topical issues, organize demonstration actions, forums, exhibitions;
- Joint assessment of community needs in different areas, joint planning, joint monitoring and evaluation, accountability, etc.

4.3. Stakeholder engagement plan

A core stakeholder engagement team consisting of ARIS staff (coordinator, environmental and social specialists, monitoring and evaluation specialist) and beneficiaries' feedback mechanism specialist will be responsible for and manage all aspects of stakeholder engagement. However, for the implementation of the various activities envisaged in the SEP, the activities targeting vulnerable groups are reflected in Table 3.

Table 3. Stakeholder engagement plan

Project Stage	Estimated Date/TimePeriod	Topic of Consultation/ Message	Method Used	Target Stakeholders	Responsible parties
Stage 1					
1.1. Project Awareness-Raising Campaign at the Oblast level	First year of project implementation	Information about the Project, including environmental and social requirements and GM	Official meetings/ consultations, official letters/emails, Online platform,	Ministries/State agencies which are part of selection of AAs LSGs of	ARIS

			GM.	selected AAs	
1.2. Project Awareness-Raising Campaign campaign at the Rayon level	First year of project implementation	Information about the Project, including environmental and social requirements and GM	Official meetings/consultations, official letters/emails, Online platform, GM.	LSGs of selected AAs Representatives of selected communities, including vulnerable groups	ARIS
1.3. Project Awareness-Raising Campaign campaign at the Local level	First year of project implementation	Information about the Project, including environmental and social requirements and GM	Public consultations, meetings, focus group discussions, local communication channels (WhatsApp groups) mass media, social mobilization activities, GM.	Communities of selected AAs including vulnerable groups Other interested parties	ARIS, LSGs
Stage 2					
2.1. Prioritization and design of subprojects by the communities at local level	During the project implementation period	Project Priorities, Design of subprojects, including environmental and social requirements	Meetings, Focus groups with vulnerable community members, Online platform, GM, Public Consultations.	Communities of selected AAs including vulnerable groups Other interested parties	ARIS, LSGs
Stage 3					
3.1. Implementation of social infrastructure subprojects	During the project implementation period	Subproject information, including environmental and social requirements ESMP, RAP preparation and implementation. GM	Meetings, Public Consultations, Focus groups with vulnerable community members, Online platform,	All stakeholders, including community members and vulnerable groups	ARIS, LSGs

			GM.		
3.2. Implementation of livelihoods subprojects	During the project implementation period	Selection of a Business Partner for implementation of the livelihood subprojects. Subproject information, including environmental and social requirements. ESMP, RAP preparation and implementation	Meetings, Public Consultations, Focus groups with vulnerable community members, Online platform, GM.	All stakeholders, including community members and vulnerable groups. Women and youth	ARIS, LSGs

4.4. Reporting back to stakeholders

Stakeholders will be kept informed as the project develops through various communication tools such as messengers, WhatsApp groups, online platform, meetings and etc., including reporting on project environmental and social performance and implementation of the stakeholder engagement plan and Grievance Mechanism, and on the project's overall implementation progress.

The Project Information in Russian and Kyrgyz languages will be disclosed on ARIS website and online platform as follows:

- Draft ESF instruments (ESMF, SEP, LMP, RPF, ESCP) prior to public consultations;
- ESF instruments once cleared by the Bank and approved by ARIS;
- Environmental and Social Framework instruments updates as needed;
- Draft ESMP, RAP prior to public consultations;
- ESMP, RAP and RAP implementation reports once approved by the Bank;
- Grievance Mechanism (GM) for the Project activities and Project workers;
- E&S performance semi-annual reports once finalized;
- Updated subproject information on the online platform.

5. Resources and Responsibilities for implementing stakeholder engagement activities

5.1. Resources

ARIS will be in charge of stakeholder engagement activities. The preliminary budget for the implementation of the stakeholder engagement plan for five years will be developed upon finalizing project design.

Table 4. Tentative budget (5 years)

Budget Category	Quantity	Unit Costs	Times/ Years	Total Costs	Remarks
1. Estimated staff salaries* and related expenses					
1a. ARIS PR specialists	1	1100	5 years	66000	
1b. Travel costs for staff (annual cost)		5000	5	25000	
2. Events					

2a. Information roundtable (one for every 40 AA)	40	400	5	80000	
2b. Meetings on project initiation (in 7 Oblasts)	7	3000	1	21000	Rental of space, food,
2c. Meeting with communities in 40 AA twice a year	80	200	5	80000	
2r. Meetings in rayons of each oblast (in 1 Oblast center, twice a year)	14	400	5	28000	
3. Communication campaign					
3a. Information materials (brochures, posters, PR-materials, including design)				20000	10 different topics about Project activities, E&S
3b. Tours of the projects for the media	12	1000	2	24000	
4. Trainings					
4a. Training on GBV for relevant ARIS staff and contractor/consultant	2	500	2	2000	
4b. Assessment of perception of citizens / project affected persons		2500	2	5000	
5. Beneficiary surveys					
5a. Mid-project perception survey	1	500	5	2500	
5b. End-of-project perception survey	1	500	5	2500	
6. GM					
6 a. training of GM (in each 40 AA)	40	500	1	20000	
6b. GM communication materials (GM brochures)	10000	0,5	2	10000	
Total				386000	
7. Other expenses					
7a. Contingencies (10%)				38600	
TOTAL STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT BUDGET				**424600**	

*Note: *Salary costs can be indicative*

6. Grievance Mechanism

The main objective of a GM is to assist to resolve complaints and grievances in a timely, effective, and efficient manner that satisfies all parties involved.

6.1. Description of GM

ARIS has implemented an institutionalized beneficiaries' feedback mechanism (BFM), which includes an enhanced grievance mechanism (GM) that incorporates all project activities.

Table 5. Addressing complaints

Step	Description of Process	Time Frame	Responsibility
GM	Structure of BFM/GM		1.1 Responsible Person at the

implementation structure	1. Central Level Objectives: ✓ Facilitate the collection of comprehensive information from beneficiaries through various BFM/GM channels. ✓ Analyze and address appeals. ✓ Regularly inform key stakeholders. ✓ Manage appeals received through different BFM ARIS channels. ✓ Register and categorize grievances in the BFM/GM system. ✓ Acknowledge receipt of complaints within 2 days (notification). 2. Tasks at Regional level: ✓ Handling of beneficiary/stakeholder appeals sent from ARIS Central Office for consideration; ✓ Facilitate strengthening of ARIS beneficiary feedback mechanism. ✓ Dissemination of information on BFM/GM in the regions.		Central Level: ARIS BFM Senior Specialist and three ARIS BFM specialists assigned to ARIS projects 1.2 Responsible staff at the regional level, ARIS Oblast Office, Oblast Coordinators, Oblast Social Mobilization, Field Officers
Grievance uptake	1. All appeals must be documented and forwarded to the designated BFM/GM staff member for the preparation of a suitable response, in coordination with the ARIS staff handling the issues raised in the appeal. Complaint form is in Annex 2. 2. To ensure the accessibility of BFM/GM, the feedback channels through which interested parties can submit appeals include, but are not limited to - appeals by phone (conversations may be recorded); - WhatsApp - a system of rapid text messaging; - social media (Facebook); - verbal or written enquiries received during working visits, field meetings and/or through field specialists; - incoming correspondence by hand to the ARIS office; - incoming correspondence by e-mail to the BFM/ GM - ARIS online platform.	Terms of execution: within 14 working days, by way of exception 30 calendar days from the date of registration of the application as needed for investigation	1.3 Responsible persons at the Central Level: ARIS Chief BFM Specialist and three ARIS BFM staff appointed to specific ARIS project

Sorting, processing	Any grievance received is forwarded to the BFM/GM], recorded in the "1C MIS" program for analysis, control and monitoring, and classified according to the following types of grievances: Classification ✓ General Issues. ✓ Complaints regarding violations of policies, guidelines, and procedures. ✓ Complaints regarding breach of contract. ✓ Complaints regarding misuse of project funds. ✓ Complaints regarding abuse of power / interference. ✓ Complaints related to sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA). ✓ Complaints related to sexual harassment (SH). ✓ Complaints related to gender-based violence (GBV). ✓ Complaints related to violation of labor legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic. ✓ Force Majeure Reports. ✓ Suggestion. ✓ Acknowledgement.	Upon receipt of complaint Notification is sent that his/her complaint has been accepted and that the proceedings have been initiated and a deadline for execution is given	Local Grievance Contact Person. Each grievance is assigned to a responsible person: BFM Specialist, Relevant coordinator and relevant project specialist
Acknowledgment and follow-up	Receipt of the grievance is acknowledged by the BFM/GM Specialist, who notifies the complainant by phone or other BFM/GM channels that his/her complaint has been accepted and proceedings have been initiated	Within 2 days of receipt	Grievance Contact Point at the local level. BFM specialist assigned to the project
Verification, investigation, action	The investigation of the complaint is managed by the Senior BFM Specialist/ BFM Specialist. The proposed decision is formulated after the investigation is complete, the citizen/beneficiary will be notified of the decision made by ARIS on his/her appeal. In case the citizen / beneficiary is not satisfied with the decision received on the appeal, he/she has the right to appeal. Explanations on how to file an appeal will be provided together with the response and communicated to the applicant - by the BFM specialist.	Within 14 working days	The appeal shall be considered by a specially created ARIS Complaint Committee. The Executive Director of ARIS establishes a Complaint Committee consisting of project managers, a specialist from BFM, a person independent from the project implementation units and other stakeholders, which will conduct the appeal hearing. Depending on the type of appeal, the composition and number of people may vary.
Monitoring	Data on complaints are collected in the		Project Coordinator, M&E

and evaluation	ARIS MIS and reported to the senior specialist of the ARIS M&E (with access to the system) on a quarterly basis. Annual report, reports are provided to ARIS ED		Specialist, ARIS Chief BFM Specialist and three ARIS BFM specialists assigned to ARIS projects
Provision of feedback	Feedback from complainants regarding their satisfaction with complaint resolution is collected in the 1C program of ARIS MIS.		Chief BFM specialist and three BFM specialists assigned to ARIS projects
Training	The training needs for staff/consultants in PIU, Contractors and Supervision Consultants are as follows: At all ARIS project events, awareness on BFM/GM is being sensitized and all capacity building trainings for new staff include the BFM/GM module.		Oblast specialists, Project specialists, BFM specialists, procurement specialists

The GM will provide an appeals process if the complainant is not satisfied with the proposed resolution of the complaint. Once all possible means to resolve the complaint have been proposed and if the complainant is still not satisfied, then they should be advised of their right to legal recourse. If the citizen/beneficiary is not satisfied with the decision received on the appeal, he/she has the right to appeal. Explanations for filing an appeal will be provided with the response. After the appeal, the citizen / beneficiary dissatisfied with the decision received at the end of the review, has the right to appeal the decision in court. The mechanism does not prevent access to judicial or administrative remedies in the Kyrgyz Republic; an aggrieved person can report his or her problem to the court at any stage of the complaint process.

All Project workers, including ARIS staff and contractors' workers, will receive information about BFM/GM from ARIS. They are also notified that they have recourse through the BFM channels if they have complaints or questions as specified in the Project Labor Management Procedures. Complaints related to labor law violations require the intervention of the HR, Legal, and Records Management Specialist of ARIS, and all labor disputes are resolved in accordance with KR labor laws.

6.2. GM channels

1. Hotline: +996(550)70-05-22, (calls are received around the clock, the conversation will be recorded); 2. WhatsApp: +996(770)70-05-22, (instant 3. messaging system for mobile devices with voice and video support); 4. Social networks (Facebook – "МОС АРИС"); 5. Online platform 6. Web-site address: www.aris.kg. 7. Verbal or written grievance received during the on-site working meetings; 8. Incoming correspondence via courier to ARIS reception; 9. Incoming correspondence by e-mail: bfm@aris.kg 10. ARIS HQ tel.: +996 (312) 301805 (reception) 11. ARIS HQ address: 102 Bokonbayev St., Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic	1. Grievances are recorded in the BFM logbook under incoming correspondence and are considered if the following information is present: • Full name; • Address of registration and residence or telephone number; • Content of the grievance; • Other reference information. If a grievance lacks any of the above data, it is recorded in the logbook under incoming correspondence of the BFM and the results of the grievance will be published in the media at the local level, on ARIS website or made public at the session of the Village and City Keneshs (Councils). 2. Grievances are entered into the BFM configuration in the 1C system for analysis and monitoring.

	3. Grievances may be submitted anonymously. Confidentiality shall be insured in all cases.

6.3. Handling of sensitive grievances

Taking into account the standards regarding the prevention of sexual exploitation and abuse/sexual harassment (SEA/SH) , which, in accordance with the requirements of the World Bank, must be observed in all projects financed by the World Bank, these standards will be observed and responsibilities take action to raise awareness on the prevention and suppression of SEA/SH. At all stages of the project implementation, all project staff and contractors will be informed about the understanding of the principles of control and prevention of risks of SEA/SH. If the SEA/SH grievance (if any) relates to ARIS activities, the BFM/GM specialist shall forward it to the Executive Director of ARIS.
All contractors will be required in the contract to commit against the use of child and forced labor, introduce mitigation measures against SEA/SH, and PIUs staff in charge of contractor supervision will monitor and report the absence of forced labor and cases of SEA/SH. All personal data and complaints received by the GM will be treated in a confidential manner, unless the complainant consents to the disclosure of their personal information.

6.4. World Bank Grievance Redress Service

Communities and individuals who believe that a World Bank-supported project is affecting them negatively can also file complaints directly with the Bank through the Bank's Grievance Redress Service (GRS) - (http://projects-beta.worldbank.org/en/projectsoperations/products-and-services/grievance-redress-service).
A complaint (grievance) can be filed in English, Kyrgyz or Russian, although consideration of complaints that are not in English will take additional time. A complaint can be filed with the Bank`s GRS through the following channels:
by email: grievances@worldbank.org
by fax: +1.202.614.7313
by mail: The World Bank, Grievance Redress Service, MSN MC10-1018, 1818 H Street Northwest, Washington, DC 20433, USA.
To the World Bank office in Kyrgyz Republic, at the address: 120, Moskovskaya Str., Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic, bishkek@worldbank.org, and by phone: +996 312 625262
The complaint (grievance) must clearly state the adverse impact believed to be caused or likely to be caused by a Bank-supported project. It should, as far as possible, be supported by available documentation and correspondence. The applicant can also indicate the desired outcome of the complaint (grievance). The complaint (grievance) must contain the full name of the person, applicant or designated representatives and contact information. Complaints filed through the GRS are dealt with as soon as possible so that problems related to the Project can be quickly resolved.
In addition, communities and individuals affected by the Project can file complaints (grievances) with the World Bank's Independent Inspection Panel, which then determines whether damage has been or could have been caused by the World Bank's failure to comply with its policies and procedures. Complaints (grievances) can be filed with the Inspection Panel at any time after the issue has been brought to the attention of the World Bank and after the management of the bank can respond. For more information on how to file complaints (grievances) with the World Bank's Inspection Panel, visit www.inspectionpanel.org.

7. Monitoring and Reporting

Monitoring and evaluation of the stakeholder process is considered vital to enable ARIS to respond to identified issues and modify the schedule and nature of engagement activities to make them more effective. Adherence to the following characteristics / commitments / activities will help in achieving successful engagement:

- Sufficient resources to accomplish the engagement;
- Inclusiveness (inclusion of key groups) of stakeholder engagement;

- Facilitation of stakeholder engagement;
- Clearly defined approaches; and
- Transparency in all activities.

Monitoring the stakeholder engagement process enables the effectiveness of the process to be assessed. In particular, by identifying key performance indicators that reflect the objectives of the SEP, as well as specific actions and timelines, the completed process can be both monitored and evaluated.
In terms of time, two separate but related monitoring activities will be implemented:

- During the execution of activities: short-term monitoring to allow adjustments / improvements to be made during the assignment; and
- After completion of all project activities: review of results at the end of the project to assess the effectiveness of SEP as implemented.

7.1. Review of Field Engagement Activities

During stakeholder engagement, the ARIS engagement team will evaluate the activities using a feedback form or asking participants questions, depending on the stakeholder group, to ensure clear messaging. The engagement team will conduct debriefing sessions while in the field. This is where it is assessed whether the required outcomes of the stakeholder engagement process have been achieved and an opportunity is provided to modify the process if necessary.
Utilizing the engagement tools developed as part of the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment, including:

- Stakeholder Database;
- Grievance log or Grievance and Response Table; and
- Minutes of all the Consultation Meetings.

In addition, this tool can be used to manage ongoing project issues and stakeholder identification and analysis processes.

7.2. Reporting on stakeholder engagement activities

The results of the activities will be reviewed after the field sessions. Additionally, the opportunity to analyze and evaluate the effectiveness between engagement sessions will be given to the engagement team (ARIS specialists) based on the level of feedback received from stakeholders during these periods.
Effectiveness will be evaluated based on the extent to which engagement activities and outcomes are consistent with those specified in this SEP. Consideration will be given to the following in assessing effectiveness:

- Materials distributed: types, frequency, and location;
- Location and timing of formal engagement activities and level of participation, including specific stakeholder groups (e.g., women, youth, community leaders);
- Number of people attending community or formal meetings;
- Number of comments received on specific issues, type of stakeholder, and details of feedback provided;
- The number and type of stakeholders who meet with the project team by mail, phone, and any other means of communication;
- Minutes of meetings, attendance logs, and photographic evidence;
- Comments received by government agencies, community leaders, and other parties and shared with the project;
- The number and types of feedback and/or complaints, and the nature and timing of their resolution; and the extent to which feedback and comments were addressed and resulted in the implementation of corrective actions.

Reporting of environmental and social activities undertaken by ARIS during the project implementation phase will be done in accordance with the requirements of the ESCP.

7.3. Project's annual reports

During the project implementation, summary monthly reports on the effectiveness of environmental and social measures for ARIS management will be prepared by the environmental and social team. These reports, including updates on the implementation of the stakeholder engagement plan, will be used to prepare annual reports, which will be reviewed by the ARIS Coordinator. The annual reports will be published on the Project website and made available in the mayor's offices of the affected municipalities.

7.4. Project's semi-annual reports on compliance with environmental and social standards

Semi-annual reports on environmental and social performance of the Project will be prepared and submitted to the World Bank during the project implementation period. This will include a section on stakeholder engagement, featuring updates on the implementation of the stakeholder engagement plan.

Annex 1. Minutes of the public consultations

SUMMARY OF THE PUBLIC CONSULTATIONS CONDUCTED ON ARIS ONLINE PLATFORM On Environmental and Social Risk Management as part of the National Community Initiatives Project (NCIP)

Venue: ARIS online platform

Location/venue: ARIS online platform (link to https://www.aris.kg/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1520&Itemid=445&lang=ru)

Date: January 19-29, 2024.

Time: From January 19, 09:00 am to January 29, 00:00 am, 2024.

Agenda: Discussion of the environmental and social management framework of the National Community Initiatives Project of the Kyrgyz Republic on ARIS online platform.

Attended by: Representatives of district government bodies, aiyl aimaks and keneshes, local residents of all 40 districts of the Kyrgyz Republic.

The online discussion was split into stages: 1st – familiarization with the document, 2nd – questions/comments on the platform.

6012 beneficiaries familiarized with the document; women's participation amounted to **3587** (60%) (**6374 views on ARIS website**).

During the online discussion on the platform, **3,588** individuals took part, with **1,701 (56%)** being women, and **520** participants opted for anonymity. The session generated a total of **3,439** comments, along with **2,232** likes and **22** dislikes. (link https://kyrgyz-demo-republic-village-covid-19.yrpri.org/post/88333).

Representatives	Number	Women
Representative of state body	860	678
Representative of municipal body	930	480
Community	3 392	1 993
Other	830	436
Total	**6012**	**3587**

During the online discussions, participants primarily conveyed gratitude for the presented information and voiced their endorsement for the content. Appreciation was extended to ARIS for their efforts in respective regions. The inquiries posed by participants largely revolved around the project's subsequent steps: its commencement timeline, the involved stakeholders, and the anticipated enhancements in social infrastructure.

Completed the discussion on the online platform: January 29, 2024

MINUTES OF THE HYBRID FORMAT PUBLIC CONSULTATIONS On Environmental and Social Risk Management as part of the National Community Initiatives Project

Venue: Bishkek, conference hall of ARIS and 40 districts of the Kyrgyz Republic connected through the internet platform Zoom. (https://zoom.us/j/95432311657?pwd=MTNzZ2N2djZBcFYvU2ljUHRGREtSQT09)
Date: January 29, 2024

Time: 11:00 am - 13:00 pm.

Agenda: Discussion of the environmental socio management framework of the National Community Initiatives Project of the Kyrgyz Republic.

Attended by: Representatives of district government bodies, aiyl aimaks and keneshes, local residents of all 40 districts of the Kyrgyz Republic.
Total Participants: 846 people, 293 women (35%)

ARIS staff introduced themselves, outlined the agenda, and acquainted participants with the event's goals and objectives. They delivered a presentation on the content of the developed environmental and social management framework of the National Community Initiatives Project in the Kyrgyz Republic, providing insight into the goals and objectives of each document. Subsequently, participants were given the opportunity to ask questions during the public consultation.

Discussion Process:

Questions from Panfilov Rayon, Chui Oblast:

1. *When does the Project start, and what is its timeline?*
2. *What is the timeframe for mobilization works?*

Answer 1: The planned timeline for the Project spans four years, from 2025 to 2029.
Answer 2: Mobilization consists of two cycles, each lasting one year.

Questions from Nookat Rayon, Osh Oblast:

1. *How will funds be allocated, and in what order?*
2. *Will grants be awarded if three AAs jointly develop livelihoods projects?*

Answer 1:
Once the project design is finalized and approved at the state level, an additional communication campaign on its implementation arrangements will be conducted. Selection criteria will be applied to select 40 AAs. Funds are allocated for social infrastructure (approximately US$450,000) and livelihoods facilities (approximately US$300,000).

Answer 2: The funding of joint livelihood project is possible if three ayil aimaks of three districts join together and decide to implement the project eligible for funding under the Project.

Question from Bazar-Korgon rayon, Jalal-Abad oblast:
Can the 32 small towns of the Kyrgyz Republic participate in this project?

Answer:
No, only aiyl aimaks are eligible to participate.

Question from Kadamjai rayon, Batken oblast:

1. What social facilities can be supported under the Project?
2. Can aiyl aimaks submit a previously prepared project for financing?

Answer 1: Funds will mainly support social infrastructure, with a focus on climate-resilient infrastructure

addressing priorities identified during the needs assessment.
Answer 2: Funds will only be allocated once the community has identified priorities outlined in the community needs assessment.

Questions from Jeti-Oguz District, Issyk-Kul Oblast:

1. *How will the selection procedure be conducted, and who will make the selection - ARIS or the commission?*
2. *Can non-subsidized AAs participate in the Project?*

Answer 1: AAs will be selected for participation based on four criteria: Poverty Indicator, Number of Population, Distance from the district center, and Subsidization. Data for these criteria will be sourced from official information channels and relevant ministries and agencies responsible for data collection.
Answer 2: Non-subsidized AAs can participate in the selection process. If they meet the four mentioned criteria and are selected, they can participate in the Project.

Question from Alai district, Osh oblast:

When does the Project start, and when can we apply?

Answer:
After the finalization and approval of the Project at the state level, an additional communication campaign on its implementation will be conducted. The Project is scheduled for a 4-year implementation, starting from 2025 to 2029.

Questions from Batken oblast:

Recommending the inclusion of 2 AAs from each district due to Batken's special status and location in border areas.

1. What social facilities can the project support?
2. Can 2 or 3 Rayons jointly propose one project?
3. How much funding is allocated for 1 AA?

Answers:

Project design targets one AA from each district.

The project can finance education, health care, public utilities, irrigation and drinking water supply, and facilities addressing local issues of importance.

Joint proposals from communities are acceptable.

US$ 450.0 thousand for social facilities and US$ 300.0 thousand for livelihoods facilities.

Question:

Which subprojects will not be financed or considered?

Answer:
The Framework Document outlines that facilities with a high risk of environmental or social impacts will be Listed in the Exclusion List once agreed and approved.

Questions from Zhaiyl Rayon, Chui oblast:

1. Will livelihoods and social infrastructure components work within one aiyl aimak?
2. What is the role of the district administration in conducting social mobilization during selection?

Answers:

Yes, social infrastructure projects will be implemented in all 40 AAs, and livelihoods projects will be financed through competition in only 15 AAs.

The role of district state administrations is to support project activities at the district level, assisting in addressing various issues, especially if projects of district importance are selected, such as hospitals and irrigation networks.

Question from Aitmatov rayon, Talas oblast:

Does the Project require community contributions?

Answer:
The Project does not require community contributions if the allocated funds are sufficient for the implementation of subprojects.

Question from Moskva rayon, Chui oblast:
Is the amount of $450,000 intended for the entire rayon or for each aiyl aimag?

Answer:
This amount is planned to be distributed to one aiyl aimag.

Question:
Is it possible for two or more aimaks from one district to participate in this Project?

Answer:
Currently, only one AA is allowed, and in case of additional funding, this matter will be considered.

Question from Kochkor rayon, Naryn oblast:
Suggestion to provide documents in the state language in the future.

Answer: This suggestion will be taken into account during the preparation of the Project.

Question from Ala-Buka rayon, Jalal-Abad oblast:

1. What will be the selection criterion for aiyl aimaks?
2. Will the Project support the construction of a central sewerage system?

Answers:

1. Selection of AAs for participation will be based on four criteria: Poverty Indicator, Population Size, Distance from District Center, and Subsidization. Data for these criteria will be obtained from official sources and relevant ministries.

2. Due to high environmental and social risks, it is unlikely that the Project will support the financing of a central sewerage system.

Question from Issyk-Kul Oblast:

Can livelihoods projects be considered in the first stage of Project implementation?

Answer:
No, in the first stage, only social infrastructure projects will be implemented. livelihoods projects will be implemented in the second stage, based on the results of the first stage, through a competitive process.

Question from At-Bashy district, Naryn oblast:

1. *subsidy percentage of mountainous regions is higher. Can the subsidy percentage of mountainous regions affect the grant size, can more funds be provided to these mountainous regions?*
2. *Is it possible to implement an livelihoods project in cooperation with private sector business partners through public-private partnership?*
3. *Can a municipal enterprise directly participate in an livelihoods project?*

Response:

1. *No, the amount of funds allocated will be the same for all AAs.*
2. *Yes, collaboration with the private sector is a mandatory requirement.*
3. *The issue has not been discussed yet, but during the development of project details ARIS will consider and discuss this possibility.*

Question:
What will the selection criterion be based on distance from the district center if villages within the AA are located at different distances from the district center?

Answer:
The selection criterion for distance from the district center will only consider the distance from the village that is considered the administrative center of the aiyl aimak to the district center.

Question:
Suggestion regarding the country's problem with sanitary landfills and how the project can help.

Answer:
The strict requirements for sanitary landfills involve extensive processes such as Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), design development, construction coordination with government agencies, which may take considerable time, and the Project might not have sufficient time for implementation.

Question from Panfilov District, Chui Oblast:
Proposal to authorize district state administrations to select aiyl aimaks, as they are more familiar with the district's problems.

Response:
The proposal has been noted. Currently, four selection criteria have been recommended.

Question:
Are these investments loan investments, and if so, who will repay them?

Response:
Yes, these investments will be issued as a loan at a zero-interest rate. The repayment period is 50 years, with repayment starting after five years.

Question:

Will municipal institutions be able to participate in livelihoods projects?

Response:
This question is currently open. According to the preliminary design, livelihoods projects will be implemented in collaboration with business partners.

Completion date: January 29, 2024.

Annex 2. Template of complaint form

Complaint form			
Ref. # (filled by GM coordinator):			
Contact details (can be anonymous)	Full name:		
	address:		
	Tel:		
	Email:		
How would you prefer to be contacted (check one box)	By mail:	By phone:	email
Preferred language	☐ Kyrgyz	☐ Russian	☐ other_____
Provide details of your complaint. Please describe the problem, who it happened to, when and where it happened, how many times, etc. Describe in as much detail as possible			
What solution to your complaint do you propose, if any? Is there anything you would like the municipality or other party/person to do to solve the problem?			
ow did you submit this form to the project?	Website ☐	Email ☐	Handed over ☐
	Personally ☐	tel ☐	Other (specify) ☐
Who completed this form (if not the person listed above)?	Full name and contact details:		
Signature			
Name of the contact person designated as the responsible person			
Resolved by or forwarded to the local level?	☐ Resolved	☐ Forwarded	Specify date, if Forwarded:
Resolved by or forwarded to central level?	☐ Resolved	☐ Forwarded	Specify date, if Forwarded:
Resolution			
Final decision (describe briefly)			
	Brief description	Accepted? (yes/no)	Brief description
1st proposed solution			
2nd proposed solution			
3rd proposed solution			